



# **Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru** **The National Assembly for Wales**

## **Y Pwyllgor Cyllid** **The Finance Committee**

**Dydd Mercher, 16 Gorffennaf 2014**  
**Wednesday, 16 July 2014**

### **Cynnwys** **Contents**

Cyflwyniad, Ymddiheuriadau a Dirprwyon  
Introductions, Apologies and Substitutions

Papurau i'w Nodi  
Papers to Note

Cyllideb Ddrafft Comisiwn y Cynulliad 2014-15  
Assembly Commission Draft Budget 2014-15

Cyllideb Ddrafft Comisiwn y Cynulliad 2014-15  
Assembly Commission Draft Budget 2014-15

Cynnig o dan Reol Sefydlog 17.42 i Benderfynu Gwahardd y Cyhoedd o'r Cyfarfod  
Motion under Standing Order 17.42 to Resolve to Exclude the Public from the Meeting

Cofnodir y trafodion yn yr iaith y llefarwyd hwy ynndi yn y pwyllgor. Yn ogystal, cynhwysir trawsgrifiad o'r cyfieithu ar y pryd.

The proceedings are reported in the language in which they were spoken in the committee. In addition, a transcription of the simultaneous interpretation is included.

**Aelodau'r pwyllgor yn bresennol**  
**Committee members in attendance**

Christine Chapman	Llafur Labour
Jocelyn Davies	Plaid Cymru (Cadeirydd y Pwyllgor) The Party of Wales (Committee Chair)
Paul Davies	Ceidwadwyr Cymreig Welsh Conservatives
Mike Hedges	Llafur Labour
Alun Ffred Jones	Plaid Cymru The Party of Wales
Julie Morgan	Llafur Labour

**Eraill yn bresennol  
Others in attendance**

Peter Black	Aelod Cynulliad, Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru (Comisiynydd y Cynulliad) Assembly Member, Welsh Liberal Democrats (Assembly Commissioner)
Nicola Callow	Pennaeth Cyllid, Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru Director of Finance, National Assembly for Wales
Craig Stephenson	Cyfarwyddwr Gwasanaethau Comisiwn Dros Dro, Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru Interim Director of Commission Services, National Assembly for Wales
Rhodri Glyn Thomas	Aelod Cynulliad, Plaid Cymru (Comisiynydd y Cynulliad) Assembly Member, Plaid Cymru (Assembly Commissioner)
Dave Tosh	Cyfarwyddwr TGCh, Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru Director of ICT, National Assembly for Wales

**Swyddogion Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn bresennol  
National Assembly for Wales officials in attendance**

Bethan Davies	Clerc Clerk
Claire Griffiths	Dirprwy Glerc Deputy Clerk
Joanest Jackson	Uwch-gynghorydd Cyfreithiol Senior Legal Adviser
Martin Jennings	Y Gwasanaeth Ymchwil Research Service

*Dechreuodd y cyfarfod am 09:01.  
The meeting began at 09:01.*

**Cyflwyniad, Ymddiheuriadau a Dirprwyon  
Introductions, Apologies and Substitutions**

[1] **Jocelyn Davies:** Welcome to this meeting of the Finance Committee. May I just remind Members to check that any electronic devices are on silent before we start?

## Papurau i'w Nodi Papers to Note

[2] **Jocelyn Davies:** Before we go to our first substantive item of the agenda, there is a number of papers to note. We have two sets of minutes of previous meetings, a letter from the Minister for Education and Skills and additional information from the Chartered Institute of Public Finance and Accountancy. Is everybody happy to note those papers? I see that you are. Thank you.

09:02

### Cyllideb Ddrafft Comisiwn y Cynulliad 2014-15 Assembly Commission Draft Budget 2014-15

[3] **Jocelyn Davies:** Members will remember that we will be scrutinising the Commission budget later on this year, in the autumn, and that this is a follow-up session from recommendations that we made during our scrutiny last year. This is pre-budget scrutiny, if you like. We have with us one of our Commissioners. Rhodri Glyn, would you like to introduce yourself and your officials for the record, and then I will go straight to the first question, if that is okay?

[4] **Comisiynydd y Cynulliad (Rhodri Glyn Thomas):** Diolch yn fawr iawn, Gadeirydd. Rwyf i yma fel y Comisiynydd sydd yn gyfrifol am ieithoedd swyddogol y Cynulliad a gyda mi y mae Craig Stephenson a hefyd Nicola Callow.

**Assembly Commission (Rhodri Glyn Thomas):** Thank you very much, Chair. I am here in my role as Commissioner with responsibility for the Commission's official languages functions, and joining me are Craig Stephenson and Nicola Callow.

[5] **Jocelyn Davies:** Thanks very much. You will know that last year we made a suggestion that perhaps members of this committee could scrutinise Commission expenditure on an ongoing basis on information communication technology and language provision out of committee and, as I said, on an ongoing basis. The Commission felt that that was not appropriate, so would you like to put on the record why you felt that that was not appropriate?

[6] **Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Gwnaeth y Comisiwn drafod yr argymhelliad, ond y teimlad yn y Comisiwn oedd mai ein sefyllfa ni fel Comisiynwyr, o ran Deddf Llywodraeth Cymru 2006, yw bod y Comisiwn yn bodoli fel endid cyfreithiol ac mae yna i fod yn atebol i'r Cynulliad yn ei gyfanrwydd. Felly, yr hyn a ddywedem ni oedd ein bod ni fel Comisiynwyr yn hapus iawn i ddod i'r pwyllgor i ateb unrhyw gwestiynau ar y gyllideb neu unrhyw gwestiynau eraill, ond nad oeddem ni mewn sefyllfa i weithredu un wrth un gydag aelod unigol o'r pwyllgor.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** The Commission did discuss the recommendation, but the feeling within the Commission was that our position as Commissioners, in relation to the Government of Wales Act 2006, is that the Assembly Commission exists as a legal entity and is accountable to the Assembly as a whole. Therefore, our view was that we as Commissioners were more than happy to appear before the committee to respond to any questions that you might have on the budget or any other issues, but that we were not in a position to work one to one with any individual member of the committee.

[7] **Jocelyn Davies:** Fine. So, you are quite comfortable with the idea of coming to committee and answering any questions that we have for you.

[8] **Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Rwy'n hapus iawn i ddod bob amser i'r pwyllgor,

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** I am more than happy to come to the committee on all

Gadeirydd.

occasions, Chair.

[9] **Jocelyn Davies:** In terms of the latest key performance indicators for Assembly Member satisfaction, you will know that satisfaction on the working in Welsh aspect of that is 6.2 out of 10—well, it was in June last year. What are you doing to address this and how confident are you that, in the results that we will see this year, there will be an improvement?

[10] **Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Wel, roedd y cwestiwn hwnnw, ar un ystyr, yn gamarweiniol, oherwydd roedd y cwestiwn yn ymwneud â gweithio trwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg, nad oedd yn gwbl berthnasol i bob Aelod o'r Cynulliad. Felly, rydym wedi addasu'r cwestiwn ar gyfer yr arolwg eleni, lle rydym yn gofyn am weithio drwy'r ieithoedd swyddogol. Fodd bynnag, rydym wedi gweithredu er mwyn ceisio cynorthwyo Aelodau sy'n ymateb i ohebiaeth trwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg. Rydym wedi sicrhau bod cyllideb yno maen nhw'n gallu ei defnyddio, ac, wrth gwrs, rydym wedi buddsoddi llawer iawn o amser ac arian yn y broses o gyfieithu peirianyddol, sy'n galluogi pobl i gael cyfieithiad yn syth, trwy ein cydweithrediad ni â Microsoft. Fodd bynnag, dylwn nodi yn y fan hon nad yw cyfieithu peirianyddol ar hyn o bryd—a na fydd byth, mewn gwirionedd—yn mynd i greu dogfen gwbl gywir. Yr hyn y mae'n rhoi i chi yw dogfen waith y gallwch ei ddefnyddio, sydd o ddefnydd ac yn galluogi pobl i weithio trwy ei dewis iaith. Os rwy'n derbyn dogfen yn Saesneg, gallaf ei chyfieithu i'r Gymraeg, ac, os rwy'n ymateb yn y Gymraeg i unrhyw un, gallant ei chyfieithu i'r Saesneg. Felly, mae pob un ohonom yn gallu dewis yr iaith yr ydym yn ei ddefnyddio. Dyna'r nod. Rydym yn gweithio tuag at sefyllfa lle mae gennym sefydliad dwyieithog yma yn y Cynulliad lle mae'r naill iaith a'r llall yn cael ei defnyddio yn gwbl naturiol, ac mae unrhyw un—Aelodau etholedig neu staff—yn gallu dewis yr iaith y maent am ei defnyddio ac yn gallu gwneud hynny ym mhob ystod o'u gwaith.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Well, that question, in one sense, was misleading, because it referred to working through the medium of Welsh, which was not entirely relevant to every Member of the Assembly. Therefore, we have adapted the question for this year's survey, where we ask about working through the official languages. However, we have taken action in order to assist Members who respond to correspondence through the medium of Welsh. We have ensured that there is a budget in place that they can use, and, of course, we have invested a great deal of time and money in the process of machine translation, which enables people to have an instant translation, and that is through our collaboration with Microsoft. However, I should note at this point that machine translation at present does not—and, if truth be told, will never—create an entirely accurate document. What it gives you is a working document that you can use, which is of use and enables people to work through the language of their choice. If I receive a document in English, I am able to translate it into Welsh, and, if I respond in Welsh to anyone, they can translate that response into English. So, each and every one of us can use our language of choice. That is the aim. We are working towards a situation where we have a bilingual institution here in the Assembly where each of the languages is used entirely naturally, and anyone—be they elected Members or staff—can choose the language that they wish to use and they can do that across the range of their activities.

[11] **Jocelyn Davies:** So, you are fairly confident then that the indicator will improve this year when we see the results.

[12] **Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Wel, o ran yr arolwg, mae unrhyw gais yr ydym wedi ei dderbyn gan Aelodau yr ydym wedi ymateb yn gadarnhaol iddo. Nid wyf yn ymwybodol o unrhyw gais lle rydym wedi methu ag ymateb i ofynion yr Aelodau, felly rwyf yn gobeithio y bydd y raddfa yn uwch y tro

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Well, in terms of the survey, any request that we received from Members we have responded positively to. I am not aware of any request where we have failed to respond to Members' demands, so I very much hope that the indicator will be more positive next year and that people will

nesaf ac y bydd pobl yn cydnabod yr hyn yr acknowledge what we have done.  
ydym wedi ei wneud.

[13] **Jocelyn Davies:** Okay, thank you. Chris, shall we come to your questions?

[14] **Christine Chapman:** Yes, okay. If we go back to the Welsh Microsoft Translator, which you mentioned earlier, what impact do you think this is having on the capacity of the Assembly's translation service, in terms of how much faster the translation can be done, compared to what it was like before?

[15] **Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Mae'r cynnydd o ran effeithiolrwydd wedi bod tua 20%. Felly, mae hynny'n gynnydd sylweddol; mae'n golygu ein bod ni'n gallu cyfieithu'n gyflymach. Mae'n golygu hefyd bod y profiad o gyfieithu—. Os siaradwch chi gydag aelodau o'r tîm cyfieithu yma, neu gyda Chymdeithas Cyfieithwyr Cymru, mae cyfieithwyr yn gwerthfawrogi'r hyn y mae cyfieithu peiranyddol yn ei gynnig iddyn nhw, oherwydd maent yn cael copi wedi'i gyfieithu ac wedyn yn mynd trwy'r broses o olygu hynny. Yn uniongyrchol o ran Aelodau, mae e'n golygu bod aelodau'r pwyllgorau, er enghraifft, yn derbyn eu briff yn y Gymraeg yn gynharach nag yr oeddent, ac felly rydym yn gweithio tuag at sefyllfa lle y bydd pob dogfen yn ymddangos ar yr un pryd yn y naill iaith neu'r llall. Nid ydym wedi cyrraedd y pwynt hwnnw eto, ond dyna rydym yn ymgynghraedd tuag ato.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** The increase in efficiency has been in the region of 20%. So, that is a significant increase; it means that we can translate more swiftly. It also means that the experience of translating—. If you speak to members of the translation team here, or Cymdeithas Cyfieithwyr Cymru—the Association of Welsh Translators and Interpreters—the translators appreciate what the machine translation offers them, because they get a translated copy and then go through the process of editing that. Directly in terms of Members, it means that committee members, for example, receive their briefs in Welsh more swiftly than was the case in the past, and therefore we are working towards a situation where every document will appear simultaneously in both languages. We have not reached that point as of yet, but is certainly our aspiration.

[16] **Christine Chapman:** Would you say that there have been savings in the time taken to translate? What about changes in resource in the commission as a result of this? Has that made a difference?

[17] **Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Wel, rydym wedi ail-fuddsoddi hynny. Mae arbedion wedi bod, ond mae'r cynnydd o ran effeithlonrwydd o 20% yn golygu ein bod yn gallu gwneud mwy o bethau ac yn gallu gwneud pethau'n gyflymach, a'n bod ni'n gallu defnyddio pobl er mwyn sicrhau ein bod ni'n ymateb i ofynion Aelodau unigol. Yr hyn yr ydym wedi bod yn ei wneud yn ystod y flwyddyn ddiwethaf, a bydd rhai aelodau o'r pwyllgor yn ymwybodol o hyn, yw mynd at Aelodau unigol a gofyn iddyn nhw beth sydd ei angen arny'n nhw i'w galluogi i weithio trwy eu dewis iaith. Rydym wedi trio ymateb i'r gofynion hynny, felly mae Aelodau wedi derbyn gwahanol bethau yn ôl eu gofynion nhw.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Well, we have reinvested those savings. There have been savings, but the increase in efficiency of 20% does mean that we can do more and do things more quickly, and that we can use people to ensure that we respond to the demands of individual Members. What we have been doing over the past year, and some members of this committee will be aware of this, is to approach individual Members and ask them what they need to enable them to work through the language of their choice. We have tried to respond to those demands, so Members have received different things according to their needs.

[18] **Jocelyn Davies:** Mike, did you want to ask a supplementary question?

[19] **Mike Hedges:** Mae'n flin gen i, ond **Mike Hedges:** I am sorry, but I will ask this in English.

[20] I have had this conversation with Rhodri Glyn before; the problem, if you are typing in Word, and you are not very confident in working in Welsh, is that every Welsh word you put in gets underlined as wrong. It does not do a lot for my confidence. Is there anything that can be done in the IT system here so that it can at least start recognising Welsh, or you could actually just flick to Welsh, when you are typing in words? It certainly worries me that it is all underlined in red, because I do not know whether it is red because it is Welsh or it is red because my Welsh is wrong.

[21] **Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** I am probably the last person you should ask about IT. I think Peter Black is coming here later on.

[22] **Jocelyn Davies:** Yes, we do have Peter coming in later.

[23] **Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** I would presume that all you have to do is to take the spell check off your computer when you are writing documents in Welsh, and then you will not get that underlining.

[24] **Mike Hedges:** Yes, but it will not spell check the Welsh, though, will it? With Welsh that is as poor as mine—as you are well aware—I need all the help I can get.

[25] **Jocelyn Davies:** You have had a conversation before now and, no doubt, it will continue afterwards.

[26] **Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Yes, but, if your IT skills are as bad as mine, you also need help, so Peter Black is coming in later, and you can ask him.

[27] **Jocelyn Davies:** Commissioner, if you have poor IT skills, please do not give advice to other people. [*Laughter.*] Take that advice from me. Paul, shall we come to your questions?

[28] **Paul Davies:** Rwyf eisiau ofyn **Paul Davies:** I do have some questions in terms of your use of resources. What areas cwestiynau ynglŷn â sut yr ydych yn defnyddio adnoddau. Pa feysydd a ydych chi have you been prioritising in terms of wedi bod yn eu blaenoriaethu o ran darparu providing more bilingual content, and what mwy o gynnwys dwyieithog, a beth yw'r are the areas planned for development in the meysydd a gynlluniwyd ar gyfer datblygu yn future? y dyfodol?

[29] **Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** O ran y **Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** In terms of the Comisiwn, mae'n bwysig, nid o ran y Commission, it is important, not just for this pwyllgor hwn, ond o ran y cyhoedd, committee, but for the public, to differentiate wahaniaethu rhwng y Cynulliad a'r between the Assembly and the Government. Llywodraeth. O ran y Cynulliad, mae pob From the point of view of the Assembly, dogfen sy'n cael ei chyhoeddi a'i dosbarthu every document published and distributed yn gyhoeddus yn ddwyieithog, ac rydym yn publicly is available bilingually, and we are awr yn symud tuag at sicrhau bod y moving to a situation in which internal dogfennau mewnol sy'n cael eu defnyddio yn documents used within the Assembly will y Cynulliad yn ymddangos yn y naill iaith a'r also appear in both official languages llall ar un pryd, oherwydd fe oedd sefyllfa lle simultaneously, because we have had a situation in which the Welsh-language y byddai'r dogfennau Cymraeg yn dod yn documents would be published later than the hwyrach na'r dogfennau Saesneg, ac rydym ni'n gweithio tuag at sicrhau nad yw hynny'n English versions, and we are working

digwydd. Rwy'n gobeithio bod rhai ohonoch wedi gweld y gwahaniaeth o ran hynny. Ein pwyslais ni o ran y cynllun yw sicrhau nad oes rhwystr i unrhyw un ddefnyddio'r naill iaith neu'r llall yn ôl ei ddewis a bod yr adnoddau ar gael. Os oes Aelodau sy'n teimlo bod rhywbeth yn eu rhwystro rhag dewis yn y modd hwnnw, fe fyddwn i'n hapus iawn edrych ar hynny. Fel y dywedais yn gynharach, nid wyf yn credu ein bod ni wedi methu ag ymateb i unrhyw alw yn hynny o beth. Felly, y nod yw sefyllfa lle mae Aelodau etholedig a staff, yn ôl eu dewis ac yn gwbl naturiol, yn gallu defnyddio'r naill iaith neu'r llall.

[30] **Paul Davies:** O ran cynhyrchu dogfennau yn y Gymraeg, sut mae hynny'n gweithio'n awr o gymharu, dywedwch, â blwyddyn neu ddwy yn ôl? Faint o ddogfennau yn fwy ydych yn eu cynhyrchu yn awr trwy'r Gymraeg?

[31] **Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Fe ddechreuwyd gyda'r pwyllgorau. Er enghraifft, fe ddechreuwyd gyda dim ond sicrhau bod y cwestiynau ar gael yn y Gymraeg, ond yn awr rydym yn sicrhau bod y wybodaeth gefndirol ar gael yn y Gymraeg hefyd, oherwydd bod rhai Aelodau yn dweud wrthym ei bod yn anodd gofyn cwestiwn ac yna feddwl am gwestiwn atodol a mynd yn ôl i'r deunydd cefndirol a bod hwnnw yn Saesneg, a bod newid yn ôl ac ymlaen yn anodd. Felly, rydym yn trio sicrhau bod hwnnw ar gael i bawb, ond rydym wedi bod yn gofyn i Aelodau: 'Beth sydd ei angen arnoch chi? Beth ydych chi'n teimlo a fyddai'n hwyluso eich defnydd o'r Gymraeg yn y pwyllgorau?' Mae'r gofynion wedi amrywio, ond rydym wedi ymateb i bob un. Felly, mae llawer iawn yn fwy yn cael ei wneud, ac mae'r arbedion hynny o 20% wedi cael eu buddsoddi er mwyn sicrhau bod hynny'n digwydd.

[32] **Paul Davies:** Sut ydych yn blaenoriaethu meysydd i ganolbwyntio adnoddau, a sut ydych yn cydbwysu rhwng anghenion Aelodau Cynulliad a defnyddwyr eraill, fel y cyhoedd, er enghraifft?

[33] **Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Wel, rydym am sicrhau bod unrhyw un sy'n ymwneud â'r

towards ensuring that that is not the case. I hope that some of you will have noticed the difference in that regard. Our emphasis in terms of the scheme is to ensure that there are no barriers to anyone who wishes to use either of the official languages according to their choice and that the resources are available to them. If Members feel that there are barriers facing them in making that choice then I would be more than happy to look at those issues. As I said earlier, I do not think that we have failed to respond to any requests in that regard. So, the aim is to reach a position where elected Members and staff can work naturally in the language of their choice.

**Paul Davies:** In terms of producing documents in Welsh, how is that working now as compared to, say, a year or two ago? How many more documents are you now producing in Welsh?

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** We started with the committees. For example, we started by simply ensuring that the questions were translated into Welsh and available in Welsh, but now we are ensuring that the background information is also available in Welsh, because there were Members telling us that it was difficult to ask a question and then think of a supplementary question when returning to background material that was only available in English, as that switch was difficult for them. So, we are endeavouring to ensure that it is available to all, but we have been asking Members: 'What do you need? What do you feel would facilitate your use of the Welsh language in committee meetings?' The requests have varied, but we have responded to each and every one. So, there is much more being done, and those savings of 20% have been invested in order to ensure that that can happen.

**Paul Davies:** How do you prioritise areas for concentrating resources, and how do you balance the needs of Assembly Members with the needs of other users, such as the public?

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Well, we want to ensure that anyone who interacts with the

Cynulliad mewn unrhyw ffordd yn gallu defnyddio'r naill iaith neu'r llall yn ôl ei ddewis. Rydym yn hyderus ein bod yn sicrhau hynny. Er enghraifft, pan mae cyfarfodydd i'r cyhoedd yma, rydym yn cynnig gwasanaeth cyfieithu ar y pryd iddynt allu deall. Gall unrhyw Aelod sy'n cynnal cyfarfod yma sicrhau bod cyfieithu ar y pryd, felly gall unrhyw un sy'n dod i mewn i'r cyfarfodydd hynny ddefnyddio'r naill iaith neu'r llall.

Assembly in any way can use either language according to their own choice. We are confident that we are ensuring that. For example, when there are public meetings here, we offer an interpretation service. Any Member staging an event here can ensure that interpretation is available, so that anyone coming into those meetings can use Welsh or English.

09:15

[34] Rydym wedi bod yn gweithio ar ymwybyddiaeth iaith gyda staff. Nid yw pob aelod o staff yn siarad Cymraeg, ond mae ymdrech gan aelodau staff i gyfarch pobl yn y Gymraeg, hyd yn oed os nad ydynt yn medru'r Gymraeg. Rydym yn ceisio sicrhau bod aelod o staff sy'n medru'r Gymraeg ar gael os yw pobl yn dewis ymwneud drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg. Gydag Aelodau etholedig a staff, rydym yn ceisio sicrhau bod modd iddynt ddefnyddio'r Gymraeg ym mhob agwedd ar eu gwaith. Rwyf i yn gallu ei wneud, felly gall unrhyw Aelod arall ei wneud.

We have been working on language awareness with staff. Not every member of staff is a Welsh speaker, but there are attempts by staff members to greet people through the medium of Welsh even if they are not Welsh speakers. We try to ensure that there is a member of staff who speaks Welsh available if people choose to communicate through the medium of Welsh. With elected Members and staff, we endeavour to ensure that they can use the Welsh language in all aspects of their work. I am able to do so, therefore any other Member can do likewise.

[35] **Paul Davies:** Nid wyf yn glir o hyd sut ydych yn blaenoriaethu eich adnoddau. Sut ydych chi'n penderfynu eich bod yn mynd i wario ar hwn yn lle gwario arian ar rywbeth arall?

**Paul Davies:** I am still not clear how you prioritise your resources. How do you decide that you are going spend on this rather on the other?

[36] **Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Mae'r flaenoriaeth yn syml; rydym yn ateb i'r galw. Nid oes cronfa benodol ar gyfer y gwasanaeth. Gwasanaeth i Aelodau ydyw, ac mae'n dod o gronfa'r gwasanaeth i Aelodau. Nid oes llinell gyllideb ar gyfer gwasanaethau drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg, na llinell gyllideb ar gyfer gwasanaethau drwy gyfrwng y Saesneg. Felly, nid yw'n fater o ofyn a oes gennym yr arian i wario yn y fan hon. Os oes cais yn dod i ni fel Comisiwn, gwnawn ymateb iddo. Fodd bynnag, ein blaenoriaeth yw ceisio hyrwyddo defnydd o'r ieithoedd swyddogol, hyrwyddo'r gallu i bobl ddewis pa iaith maent yn ei defnyddio, a sicrhau nad oes unrhyw rwystrau. Felly, os oes unrhyw un yn dweud wrthym, 'Mae hyn yn fy atal rhag gwneud dewis ieithyddol yn y fan hon', dyna fyddai ein blaenoriaeth.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** The priority is simple; we respond to the demand. There is no specific budget for the service. It is a service for Members, and it comes from the Members' services budget. There is no budget line for Welsh language services, nor a budget line for English-medium services. So, it is not a matter of asking whether we have the money to spend here. If a request is made to us a Commission, we will respond to that. However, our priority is to try to promote the use of the official languages, promote the ability of people to choose whichever language they wish to use, and ensure that there are no barriers to that. So, if anyone tells us, 'This precludes me from making a linguistic choice in that area', that would become a priority.

[37] **Jocelyn Davies:** Julie, did you have a question?

[38] **Julie Morgan:** It was about your earlier comment, Rhodri, that it was important for the public to distinguish between the Commission and the Government. Do you have evidence that the public is distinguishing between the different ways that the two bodies are tackling this issue?

[39] **Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Aethom allan yn wreiddiol i gynnal sesiynau gyda'r cyhoedd ynglŷn â'r Bil Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru (Ieithoedd Swyddogol). Roedd pob cŵyn roeddwn yn ei derbyn yn ystod y cyfnod hwnnw ynglŷn â diffygion o ran cynhyrchu deunydd drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg yn ymwneud â'r Llywodraeth yn hytrach na'r Cynulliad. Roeddwn yn gorfod dweud wrthynt drwy'r amser, 'Mae'n ddrwg gen i, nid fy nghyfrifoldeb i yw Llywodraeth Cymru; mae fy nghyfrifoldeb i yn ymwneud â'r Comisiwn'. Felly, o ran endid y sefydliad, rwy'n credu bod pobl yn dal yn ei chael yn anodd gwahaniaethu, ac rydym yn dal yn derbyn cwynion am faterion sy'n ymwneud â Llywodraeth Cymru, yn hytrach na'r Comisiwn.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** We originally held sessions with the public on the National Assembly for Wales (Official Languages) Bill. Every complaint that I received during that consultation period on deficiencies in terms of producing materials through the Welsh language related to the Government rather than the Assembly. I had to keep telling them, 'I'm sorry, the Welsh Government is not my responsibility; my responsibility relates to the Commission'. Therefore, in terms of the entity of the institution, I believe that people still find it difficult to differentiate, and we still receive complaints about issues that relate to the Welsh Government, rather than the Commission.

[40] **Julie Morgan:** Thank you. I thought that the confusion still continued.

[41] **Jocelyn Davies:** Ffred, shall we come to your questions?

[42] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Gallaf dystio bod gwelliant wedi bod o ran y ddarpariaeth i'r rhai ohonom sydd yn defnyddio'r Gymraeg. Fodd bynnag, y cwestiwn sydd gen i yw: a ydych yn gallu adnabod cost ddisgwyliedig y gwasanaeth cyfieithu a chofnodi yn y Cynulliad yn y flwyddyn gyfredol? A ydych yn gwybod beth ydyw?

**Alun Ffred Jones:** I can testify that there has been improvement in terms of the provision for those of us making use of the Welsh language. However, my question is: can you identify the expected cost of the translation and reporting service in the Assembly in the current year? Do you know what it is?

[43] **Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Gallem, wrth reswm, gofnodi'r gost o redeg yr uned yn y Cynulliad, a gallwn gofnodi cost y gwaith sy'n mynd yn allanol i gyfieithwyr annibynnol i'w wneud. Fodd bynnag, mae hyn yn rhan o'r gwasanaeth i Aelodau, felly oherwydd hynny rydym yn gwasanaethu Aelodau yn y ddwy iaith. Nid wyf yn gallu cynnig ffigur i chi ynglŷn â gwasanaethu drwy gyfrwng y Saesneg ychwaith. Yn amlwg, mae eitemau y gallwn gofnodi faint yr ydym yn ei wario arnynt.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** We can, of course, provide a figure in terms of the costs of running the unit in the Assembly, and we can also report the cost of the work done externally by independent translators. However, this is part of our service for Members, and as a result we serve Members through the medium of both languages. I cannot give you a figure on the cost of services through the medium of English either. Clearly, there are items that we can report our expenditure on.

[44] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Rwy'n credu y byddai'n ddefnyddiol i ni gael gymaint o wybodaeth â phosibl, felly, os nad yw'r

**Alun Ffred Jones:** I think that it would be useful to us to have as much information as possible, so, if you do not have that

wybodaeth gennych y bore yma, a fyddech cystal â chyflwyno hynny o wybodaeth sydd gennych ynglŷn â chostau'r gwasanaeth cyfieithu? Rwy'n derbyn y pwynt yr ydych yn ei wneud mai gwasanaeth i Aelodau ydyw, ond mae cost, onid oes, i hynny?

[45] **Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Oes. O ran 2014-15, o fewn y gyllideb, mae ffigur o £242,500 wedi ei glustnodi ar gyfer cyfieithu allanol, ond mae'r uned yn y Cynulliad yn rhan sylfaenol o gostau'r Comisiwn. Felly, mae'r uned yn gwneud nifer o bethau gan gynnwys cyfieithu dogfennau, felly, mae'r ffigur arall—. Os ydych chi'n gofyn inni i rannu beth yw'r canrannau gwahanol o ran y gwasanaeth i Aelodau, fe allwn ni gynnig y ffigur cyflawn ichi o ran y gwasanaeth i Aelodau, ond mae'r gwasanaeth yn cael ei gyflwyno yn y naill iaith a'r llall.

[46] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Ydy, ond byddai rywun yn tybio bod rhaniadau o fewn y gost gyflawn honno y byddech chi'n gallu eu hadnabod fel cost y gwasanaeth cyfieithu—

[47] **Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Ni fyddai'r ffigurau yn cyfateb i'r gwariant sy'n cael ei wneud ar wasanaethau drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg, megis y ffigur rwyf newydd ei gyflwyno i chi, sef y ffigur am gyfieithu allanol.

[48] **Alun Ffred Jones:** I ddod at y ffigur hwnnw, mae'n ffigur sydd, yn syml iawn, ar gyfer talu pobl i wneud gwaith cyfieithu sydd ddim yn rhan o staff mewnol.

[49] **Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Ydy.

[50] **Alun Ffred Jones:** A ydych chi'n gwybod beth yw hwnnw fel canran o wariant y gwasanaeth cyfieithu? Os ydych chi'n gallu adnabod hwnnw fel gwariant ar gyfieithu, rwy'n cymryd bod gwariant mewnol sy'n cyfateb iddo.

[51] **Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Mae gennym uned yn y fan hon sy'n ymwneud â gwahanol agweddau ar waith y Comisiwn. Mae'n ymwneud â chyfieithu, y Cofnod a darpariaeth ar gyfer pwyllgorau. Felly, galleu roi'r swm am yr uned honno yn ei chyfanrwydd ichi, os mai dyna yw'r hyn ydych chi'n chwilio amdano.

information this morning, would you be so kind as to present the information you have on the cost of the translation service? I accept your point that this is a service for Members, but there is a cost attached to that, is there not?

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Yes. In terms of 2014-15, within the budget, a figure of £242,500 has been allocated for a call-off contract for translation, but the unit in the Assembly is a fundamental part of the Commission's costs. Therefore, the unit does a great many things including translating documents, therefore, the other figure—. If you are asking us to disaggregate the various percentages in terms of services for Members, then we can give you the total figure for Members' services, but that is provided in both languages.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** Yes, but one would expect that there would be some disaggregation that you could identify as the cost of the translation service—

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** The figures would not correspond to the expenditure made on services through the medium of Welsh, such as the figure that I have just given you, which is the figure for external translation.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** If I could come on to that figure, it is simply to pay people to do translation work externally.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Yes, it is.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** Do you know what that is as a percentage of the expenditure on the translation service? If you can identify that as expenditure on translation, I assume that there is internal expenditure that corresponds to that.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** We have a unit in this place that deals with various aspects of the Commission's work. It relates to translation, to the Record of Proceedings and the provision for committees. So, we could give you the figures for that service as a whole, if that is what you are looking for.

[52] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Rwy'n meddwl y byddai unrhyw wybodaeth yn ddefnyddiol. O ran y defnydd o gontractwyr allanol, a yw'r swm hwnnw'n codi neu'n gostwng?

**Alun Ffred Jones:** I think that any information would be useful. In terms of the use of external contractors, is that figure increasing or decreasing?

[53] **Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Nid wyf yn credu—

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** I do not think—

[54] **Mr Stephenson:** Mae'n lleihau. Mae'r costau dros gyfnod o amser wedi lleihau, yn enwedig ers i ni ddefnyddio cyfieithu peirianyddol. Rydym yn disgwyl i bobl allanol gyfieithu efo peiriant ac wedyn wneud y gwelliannau, felly mae'r costau ar gyfer pob 1,000 o eiriau wedi gostwng o £127 i £50. Felly, mae mwy yn cael ei gyfieithu mewn llai o amser, ac ar ôl edrych ar ôl adnoddau yn rhesymol a defnyddio sgiliau ynglŷn â *procurement* a rheoli contractau, rydym wedi lleihau'r swm.

**Mr Stephenson:** It is decreasing. The costs over a period of time have reduced, particularly since we started making use of machine translation. We expect external translators to use machine translation and then edit those translations, therefore, the cost per 1,000 words has reduced from £127 to £50. So, more is being translated in less time, and in terms of reasonably managing our resources and using skills in terms of procurement and contract management, we have been able to reduce those costs.

[55] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Felly, mae'r gostyngiad hwnnw o ganlyniad uniongyrchol i'r cyfieithu peirianyddol sydd wedi cael ei gyflwyno.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** So, that reduction is as a direct result of the use of machine translation that has been introduced.

[56] **Mr Stephenson:** Ie, dyna chi—defnyddio technoleg yn well i leihau'r costau ar gyfer y Cynulliad.

**Mr Stephenson:** Yes, that is right. That is making better use of technology to reduce costs for the Assembly.

[57] **Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Mae agweddau eraill hefyd o ran costau. Hynny yw, os ydych chi'n gofyn am gyllideb yr adran gyfieithu yn ei chyfanrwydd, mae honno'n £2.2 miliwn, ac mae £1.9 miliwn yn ymwneud â chyflogau staff. Fodd bynnag, mae'n rhaid ichi ystyried bod aelodau staff mewn adrannau eraill hefyd, er enghraifft, mae aelod newydd wedi'i phenodi i'r Swyddfa Gyflwyno yn benodol ar gyfer gwneud gwaith drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg ac er mwyn sicrhau bod y system yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno'n gweithio'n gyflymach. Mae aelodau staff yn awr yn yr adran ffioedd sy'n medru delio â materion drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg, felly mae buddsoddiadau mewn amrywiol adrannau.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** There are, of course, other aspects in terms of costs. If you are asking about the budget of the translation service in its entirety, that is £2.2 million, and £1.9 million relates to staffing costs. However, you must also bear in mind that there are staff members in other departments, for example, a new member of staff has been appointed to the Table Office and has been appointed specifically to work through the medium of Welsh in order to ensure that the system in the Table Office can work more swiftly and efficiently. There are now staff members in the fees office who can deal with issues through the medium of Welsh, so there is investment in various departments.

[58] Rwy'n pwysleisio nad oes llinell benodol ac ni ddylai fod llinell benodol ar gyfer gwasanaethau drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg, oherwydd rydym yn gwasanaethu Aelodau yn y ddwy iaith. Er mwyn cael llinell o wasanaethau drwy gyfrwng y

I emphasise that there is no specific budget line for the Welsh language and there should not be a specific budget line for Welsh-medium services, because we serve our Members through the medium of both languages. In order to have a budget line for

Gymraeg, bydd yn rhaid inni gael llinell gyfatebol ar gyfer gwasanaethau drwy gyfrwng y Saesneg, ac nid yw hynny erioed wedi bodoli. Welsh-language services, we would have to have a corresponding budget line for the English language, and that has never existed.

[59] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Diolch yn fawr. **Alun Ffred Jones:** Thank you.

[60] **Jocelyn Davies:** Okay. Mike is next.

[61] **Mike Hedges:** Carrying on from what Alun Ffred was asking, how do you decide what to outsource and what not to? How do you work out the balance of people who you employ centrally and the amount of work that is outsourced? How do you come to the conclusion whether to employ one more person, or to outsource, or to employ one less person and outsource? How do you decide that?

[62] **Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Yn ddelfrydol, byddem yn dymuno bod y gwaith i gyd yn cael ei wneud yn fewnol, oherwydd dyna'r ffordd fwyaf effeithiol o weithio, ond rydym yn cael ein hunain drwy'r amser mewn sefyllfa lle mae gwaith ychwanegol sydd angen ei wneud, a hwnnw sy'n cael ei anfon allan i'w wneud. Felly, mae'r mwyafrif helaeth o'r gwaith yn cael ei wneud yn fewnol, ond rydym yn dibynnu ar gontractwyr allanol i wneud y gwaith ychwanegol. **Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Ideally, we would like to see all of the work done internally, because that is the most efficient way of working, but we find ourselves in situations where there is additional work that needs to be done, and that is what is outsourced. So, the vast majority of the work is carried out internally, but we are dependent on external contractors to do that additional work.

[63] **Mike Hedges:** Could better planning not stop that from happening?

[64] **Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Byddai cynllunio, yn ddelfrydol, yn sicrhau bod y cyfan yn cael ei wneud yn fewnol, ond mae ffactorau eraill. Os ydych yn cyflogi pobl yn fewnol, mae costau ychwanegol yn deillio o hynny. Gall Nicola esbonio hynny, ond byddai hynny'n golygu y byddai'r gost fewnol hwyrach yn fwy, ac, ar adegau, mae'n fwy cost effeithiol i roi'r gwaith allan nag ydyw i'w wneud yn fewnol. **Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Ideally, planning would ensure that everything could be done internally, but there are other factors. If you employ people internally, there are additional costs arising from that. Nicola can explain that, but that would mean that the cost internally would perhaps be greater and, at times, it is more cost-effective to outsource that work rather than do it internally.

[65] **Ms Callow:** I will chip in here with some other things about the value-for-money side of it. Just to give you a sense of reassurance around keeping the outsourcing at an appropriate level, staffing levels within the translation and reporting service have been pretty much static over the last three to four years, so the outsourced contract is very much used to accommodate any particular peaks in work. There has been some value-for-money work done on procuring such contracts as well, so that we can get the cost of that sort of translation down.

[66] On your point about better planning, yes, there are lots of areas in the organisation where we do that. If I might choose an area in my particular service as an example, the better planning that we do in engaging with the translation team for the production of the budget and the production of the annual report and accounts enables people to be available at very planned short notice, so that we have quite a bit of notice that there will a very quick turnaround of a substantial piece of work. The translation and reporting team, in particular, has been very adept at responding to that need and keeping those costs down so that they do

not incur unnecessary and unexpected overtime. So, there are multiple ways in which we are dealing with this.

[67] **Mr Stephenson:** May I just add something about the staff planning? To meet the demands of the translation service over the last few years—. There are three elements to the work of the translation and reporting service: there is the production of the Record of Proceedings, the text translation and simultaneous translation. Over the last few years, to be able to deal with peaks and troughs in workloads, we have a set of staff that can do all three aspects of the work. So, if, for example, we have a very long Plenary session when we are passing legislation, we can move our text translators to work on the Record of Proceedings so that we manage to produce the Record of Proceedings in line with Standing Order requirements. Having that flexibility with call-off contracts enables us to meet our requirements and also to deliver the translation on time. So, the planning is paying off because we have this flexible team of people who can meet the demands that the service requires.

[68] **Mike Hedges:** For my final question, you said that the staffing levels have remained roughly constant. Has demand gone up or down?

[69] **Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Mae'r galw wedi cynyddu, ond, wrth gwrs, rydym wedi llwyddo i sicrhau ein bod yn gweithio'n fwy effeithiol. Roeddwn yn sôn yn gynharach am y ffigur o 20% o ran arbedion effeithiolrwydd. Felly, rydym wedi gallu ailfuddsoddi hynny. Fel yr oedd Nicola a Craig yn dweud, mae amrywiadau yn ôl galwadau na allwn bob amser eu rhagweld, ac rydym yn defnyddio adnoddau allanol er mwyn ateb y galw hwnnw. Felly, ydym, rydym yn gwneud mwy, ond rydym yn gwneud mwy yn gyflymach ac yn fwy effeithiol nac yr oeddem.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** The demand has increased, but of course we have managed to ensure that we work more efficiently. I mentioned earlier that figure of 20% in terms of efficiency savings. So, we have been able to reinvest that. As Nicola and Craig said, there are peaks and troughs in terms of demand that we cannot always anticipate, and we use external resources to respond to that demand. So, yes, we are doing more, but we are doing it more swiftly and more efficiently than we were in the past.

[70] **Jocelyn Davies:** You said quite a bit there about upskilling staff and that you had made a big investment in upskilling staff. Do you know what the cost of the current Welsh-learning scheme is? If you do not know, perhaps you could send us a note.

09:30

[71] **Mr Stephenson:** On tuition, I have got the figure. It was £24,000 in the last financial year. That is what we spent.

[72] **Jocelyn Davies:** Do you benchmark that against other public bodies or other organisations to make sure that that is being well spent?

[73] **Mr Stephenson:** We use feedback, surveys and the performance management system to assess the learning. We have a priority coming up in the coming year on a bilingual skills audit, so we will be able to assess the existing skill levels across the organisation in both languages. We will be able to use that as a benchmark for future years. On the impact of the training, we want to be able to measure its success. We are doing some work at the moment in considering the tuition for Members and their staff and ours to see whether we can assimilate those, rather than running two separate public sector contracts. So, we are looking at all of that at the moment, again, to get best value and to make the right impact for learners.

[74] **Jocelyn Davies:** So, benchmarking this with other organisations is something that you would automatically do in terms of the cost of it and—

[75] **Mr Stephenson:** The cost is through public sector procurement rules. It is quite interesting that, in all of this, since we have had the official languages scheme, we are seeing more and more people coming to us to benchmark against us and to see what we are doing, how machine translation has created savings and benefits for the organisation in terms of bilingualism. So, it is kind of working the other way around, although we do keep in touch with national organisations to check that we are—

[76] **Jocelyn Davies:** Do you want to add something?

[77] **Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** There are two things perhaps to note over and above what Craig has said. First of all, we have not turned down anybody who has asked us for the opportunity to learn the language, and that will continue. Whenever anybody asks, we will respond to that, and that is our responsibility. Secondly, I think that it is fair to say that there is not another institution in Wales where the majority of people working in that institution do not speak Welsh that does more than we do to promote the Welsh language and the use of the Welsh language. You can talk about institutions like S4C, the Eisteddfod or Cyngor Gwynedd, where the majority of people are Welsh speaking, that perhaps you could say do as much, if not more, than us. However, in terms of institutions where the majority of the people working there are non-Welsh-speaking, nobody does as much as we do. As Craig said, we have other public sector organisations coming in and looking at what we are doing and using that as a benchmark for them.

[78] **Jocelyn Davies:** Okay. Julie, shall we come to your questions?

[79] **Julie Morgan:** Do you have a map that shows where a Welsh speaker is available throughout the building? For example, if somebody comes into the Senedd at the entrance—if a member of the public who wants to talk in Welsh comes into the Senedd—is there always somebody there they could talk to in Welsh?

[80] **Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** There should always be somebody there who speaks Welsh. More often than not, there is more than one person there who is able to speak Welsh. In terms of the people who offer the guided tours, there should always be somebody available who can do that through the medium of Welsh. Our goal is to ensure that whenever anybody requests a service through the medium of Welsh, there is somebody there to do it, and by and large we have succeeded in doing that. There are always situations where, for one reason or another, that does not happen, but we get very few complaints about the lack of service through the medium of Welsh.

[81] **Mr Stephenson:** Since 2007, in what was then the Welsh language scheme, we have had language plans in place across all service areas. That enables us to assess the need for bilingual services and then to plan, when a post becomes vacant, whether we should make the post ‘Welsh essential’, so that we can always provide a service in both languages to our customers. Where there are lots of customer-facing roles, the majority of staff are bilingual. In other areas, they may not be. Our resources move around to meet the needs of the scheme and in accordance with the language plans that each service head is responsible for updating.

[82] **Julie Morgan:** What about the security service?

[83] **Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** I was about to say that, in terms of contracts that we give out on tender, we are, of course, unable to control that situation, but we try to ensure that the contractors are aware that it is a bilingual institution and that people will want to have the service through the medium of Welsh. We offer staff the opportunity to learn the language if

they so choose, but we cannot force them to do so. However, we have been doing language awareness courses with the staff throughout the Assembly. Even people on the higher grades have had language awareness courses—people like Nicola and Craig have had it—as have security staff. I was greeted through the medium of Welsh this morning, yesterday morning—I am greeted in Welsh most mornings when I enter the building. In the report, Aled Roberts, I think, says that he has noticed a difference: that people are greeting him through the medium of Welsh because he wears one of these lanyards, which shows that he is a Welsh speaker. So, the language awareness sessions are working. Obviously, we hope that that will improve.

[84] **Julie Morgan:** In your employment policy, you want to reflect the diverse nature of the area, particularly the area where this building is placed, and we know that people from ethnic minorities are less likely to have any Welsh, compared to the white population. How do you balance that? You have two things that you want to fulfil, do you not?

[85] **Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** As we said earlier, we want to ensure that there are Welsh speakers available in every department, but that does not mean that every individual job is advertised as one where Welsh is necessary. It is to do with face-to-face services and a percentage of the staff being able to speak Welsh. I think that you are right to say that, probably—this is only a rough guess; I am not sure whether we have any percentage figures—we are failing to reflect the ethnicity of the area in terms of employment. We would, hopefully, want to increase the number of people from ethnic minorities we employ here.

[86] **Mr Stephenson:** I will just add to Rhodri's comments. We produce an annual equality report and, as part of the production of that, we assess the workforce, protected characteristics and recruitment. In the analysis of that, the number of black minority ethnic staff has increased, but has not increased to be in line with the Cardiff travel-to-work area, which is a statistic that we benchmark against. So, once we noticed that, as a management board, we produced an action plan to address it. It will be about how we recruit. It will also be tied in with language planning. We have someone now seconded to us who recently joined us to work through that action plan. So, it is an area that we have recognised. We want to see some action and some positive outcomes there. Basically, we are always keen to reflect the wider community in our staff make up, and although there is no cause for panic, there is a need to do some proactive work, which we have recognised. We are starting to work through that action plan now.

[87] **Jocelyn Davies:** We have run out of questions and time. I do not think that you need to send us a note, because you had the figure there. So, thank you very much. We will send you a transcript for you to check before we publish it. I think that that was a very useful session in the lead up to us looking at the Commission budget in the autumn. Thank you.

09:40

### **Cyllideb Ddrafft Comisiwn y Cynulliad 2014-15 Assembly Commission Draft Budget 2014-15**

[88] **Jocelyn Davies:** We have other people from the Commission coming in now. Please take your seats. Information and communications technology was another aspect of the Commission's work that we wanted to look at. We have a different Assembly Commissioner with responsibility in this area. Peter, would you like to introduce yourself and your officials? Nicola does not need to introduce herself, because she has been here all morning, so if you would like to introduce yourself and your official, we will go straight to questions.

[89] **Peter Black:** I am Peter Black. I am the Assembly Commissioner for ICT and sustainability. I have on my left, Dave Tosh, who is the director of ICT. You have already met

Nicola Callow, who is director of finance for the Commission.

[90] **Jocelyn Davies:** Lovely, thank you. Peter, the Commission's performance report states that the project transfer management of ICT services from ATOS to the Commission was completed early and below budget. Can you provide details of where savings were made against budget and how these savings were achieved? Coming in below budget and early on an ICT project—somebody ought to write a book, I think. [*Laughter.*] I think it would be well read. So, Peter, where were the savings made and how did you manage that?

[91] **Peter Black:** Well, it is easier to make savings on insourcing than it is on outsourcing. The actual savings were £472,000 this financial year in terms of the service. That is 10% of the operational budget. In the actual project management projections over five years, we were aiming to save £3.81 million anyway over the five-year period in terms of how we would deliver the service in-house as compared to the ATOS contract. Those figures have proved so far to be robust and have reflected the actual experience, although technically we do not actually take full charge of the service until 31 July—this month.

[92] **Jocelyn Davies:** Chris, shall we come to your questions?

[93] **Christine Chapman:** Yes, thanks. Sorry, what level of savings did you say, Peter?

[94] **Peter Black:** It was £472,000 this financial year.

[95] **Christine Chapman:** Where were these resources reallocated?

[96] **Peter Black:** What we have done is to effectively put in place an ICT investment programme. So, we are reinvesting that money in ICT. We have a number of projects to try to improve the services for Members. There are a number of developments being forced on us as part of the change anyway. For example, we have to have a new telephony contract in place in the next 12 months. We are also moving towards the '.cymru' and '.wales' domain names and we are also looking at upgrading and improving constituency offices' networking to allow Wi-Fi and local internet connections. We are refreshing the constituency office kit. We are doing a refresh of the Siambur and we are also improving access to systems and to information. At the moment, we are piloting cloud-based information services as well. So, we are reinvesting this to try to upgrade the service and to make sure that we have a much better, more responsive service for Members.

[97] **Jocelyn Davies:** Peter, I do not really believe that information is kept in a cloud. [*Laughter.*] Where is it actually? Or perhaps Dave—do you want to tell us?

[98] **Peter Black:** This is a very technical question—

[99] **Jocelyn Davies:** Do not overload me with information, but what does that mean for us, this cloud-based—

[100] **Mr Tosh:** You are right, it is not held in a cloud. However, the advantages to us are that we contract with a third party accredited organisation that meets UK and international security standards so that our data are protected. I could argue that they are probably more protected and more resilient being hosted externally than they are on site. It is also much cheaper for us to do that, because we can reduce the number of servers and the amount of storage space that we need and the support contracts to look after all of the infrastructure that we put our data on at the moment. So, what we are doing is working with Microsoft—they do not come much bigger than Microsoft—and we are using its service called Azure. Over time, we will migrate e-mail and then our data into the cloud, as appropriate. There will be some elements of what we do that we do not migrate, but the vast majority of information that we

have we can move there. The reason is that it is cheaper and more resilient than we can afford to provide ourselves.

09:45

[101] **Jocelyn Davies:** So, the cloud. Physically, where is this cloud going to be—because it will exist as something that you can touch?

[102] **Mr Tosh:** Yes, sure. Microsoft has two data centres in Europe—it has one on the mainland of Europe, and it has one in Dublin. So, the data are within the EU area and they are subject to all of the protections that our data here are subject to. You are right, there are physical locations.

[103] **Jocelyn Davies:** Julie, shall we come on to your questions while I think about that last answer? [*Laughter.*]

[104] **Julie Morgan:** I will have to think about that as well. Going back to the savings, are they available in this financial year, 2014-15?

[105] **Peter Black:** Yes, we have savings in this financial year that we are reinvesting.

[106] **Julie Morgan:** In what will you be investing?

[107] **Peter Black:** We will be investing in ICT. For example, you all have access to iPads now, which has been part of that investment, and which we are able to use for committee papers. We have reformatted and rebuilt the service desk to make it more receptive and to better fit Members' needs. It is that kind of investment. We have also put Wi-Fi in. We have looked at reinvesting all those savings in those sorts of upgrades, so that Members have a much better service, and so that they are able to work on the move, which, I think, meets modern requirements and certainly meets the needs of an Assembly Member.

[108] **Julie Morgan:** It is essential.

[109] **Mr Tosh:** Part of that investment—. I use the analogy that it is a bit like buying a house from somebody where not a lot of renovation has been done for a number of years. We have inherited this ICT infrastructure, and it needs a level of work to make it fit for our purposes. So, we are investing some of that saving in the infrastructure, to allow us to use cloud services, but also to make it simpler to use and more streamlined and, therefore, more cost-effective. We need to do that first of all. We need to renovate the house before we can do some of the more exciting things that we need to do. We are funding that out of the savings that we have made, and that is a commitment to deliver part of the ICT strategy, which is to simplify, to reduce the cost, and to provide a platform for future improvement.

[110] **Peter Black:** David is the tactful side of this team. [*Laughter.*]

[111] **Julie Morgan:** So, it is unlikely that any of these savings will go anywhere other than ICT.

[112] **Mr Tosh:** We have the choice. We have an investment and resources board, which decides where all of the investment money goes for the Commission. So, it is not given to me to spend without any control; I have to convince the board that this is the most appropriate use of the money that we have. Some of the savings that we made on the project delivery went back to the investment board last year and were spent on non-ICT things. So, there is a level of funding that will go to ICT, because that means that we do not have to find new money, but it is not a certainty that it will always be spent on ICT. We will take the opportunity to spend

it for the benefit of the Commission.

[113] **Peter Black:** With every ICT project that we invest in, we have to make the case to the board, and convince it that this is going to produce the sort of value for money and outcomes that we expect from it. It is measured against other projects that are also bidding for that money.

[114] **Jocelyn Davies:** Who sits on the board?

[115] **Peter Black:** The board mostly consists of senior members of the management team.

[116] **Mr Tosh:** It is the chief executive, some of the directors—. Nicola advises us from a financial point of view. So, we have proper scrutiny, and our internal audit staff attend occasionally.

[117] **Peter Black:** The Commission provides oversight for that and approves the bigger projects. Also, it will pass ideas back to that board as well.

[118] **Jocelyn Davies:** So, you are not a budget holder in the sense that a budget is allocated to you that you can decide to spend on whatever you choose. Even if you make savings, you have to make a case; you do not automatically keep them.

[119] **Mr Tosh:** Absolutely, and that is right and proper, because we are talking about large sums of money.

[120] **Peter Black:** Dave does hold a budget in terms of the staff that he oversees, and in terms of the contracts that he oversees, but any money that is saved from that will have to go back to the board to be reconsidered.

[121] **Julie Morgan:** So, is there any likelihood that any money will go back to the Welsh Government?

[122] **Peter Black:** I think that that is unlikely. Obviously, in terms of our overall budget strategy, we have some very tight controls on that and on how much we are going to spend. We spend, I think, 3% of the Welsh block, and we make sure that any underspend will be reinvested into that. I suppose, Nicola, that if we had money left over that we could not spend, we would put it back into the pool, but that has not happened so far.

[123] **Ms Callow:** If I may, our budget is 0.3% of the Welsh block, though it would be nice if it were 3%. [*Laughter.*] So, yes, in terms of whether or not we would be giving money back to the Welsh Government, it is always a course available to us if we have a substantial underspend, and, indeed, we did this last year when we had an unexpected windfall towards the end of the financial year. So, we did give money back with plenty of notice so that the Welsh Government could make best use of it. So, we use those facilities where it is right and proper for us to do so, but our prime concern is the Assembly Members and to make sure that the Commission is delivering all the services that it needs to deliver. Our first priority and our first preference would always be to ensure that we are using those moneys internally wisely and properly. You will have heard in previous budget sessions about the investment board and its approach in making sure that there are plenty of plans that are flexible to accommodate year end, to accommodate the number of projects that we have, and to ensure that any underspend on one project can be utilised elsewhere. So, it is all part of how we like to manage the finances of the organisation.

[124] **Julie Morgan:** So, what were the particular circumstances that made you give money back to the Welsh Government last year? I do not know whether I should know this, but I do

not know.

[125] **Ms Callow:** It is in our supplementary budget and the explanatory note that we laid, and I can send that to you after the meeting for your information, if you would like. It came about because we had the Cardiff office of the Valuation Office Agency come around to make an assessment of the rateable value of our estate. We were not expecting anything to come of that, but we had an unexpected and quite significant amount of savings. We had quite a significant amount that we could not utilise in the 2013-14 year; however, there are significant savings going forward for each subsequent year that I can assure you we are most certainly able and willing to use.

[126] **Jocelyn Davies:** So, unexpectedly, the overheads were cheaper than you thought—

[127] **Ms Callow:** Yes, it was at a quite late point in the financial year as well, which made it particularly challenging for us. So, we took the decision that it was right and proper to give it back to the Welsh Government through the Welsh consolidated fund for it to allocate again and use accordingly.

[128] **Jocelyn Davies:** Are you happy with that, Julie?

[129] **Julie Morgan:** Thank you, yes.

[130] **Jocelyn Davies:** Paul is next.

[131] **Paul Davies:** Thank you, Chair. The Commission's performance report states that the

[132] 'insourcing of ICT services will lead to significant improvements.'

[133] The latest KPI for Member satisfaction with ICT was 6.3 out of 10. What are you doing to address this, and how confident are you that results in the July 2014 survey will show an improvement?

[134] **Peter Black:** That KPI, of course, is a year old and, effectively, it was measuring Atos as opposed to us. We accept that that was not good enough and we are hoping to improve on that in the current survey that is going out. Of course, that will still be measuring Atos, because we have not handed the system over as yet, but we think that we have made significant improvements. We hope that by investing in the infrastructure, by simplifying that infrastructure, and by improving the services to Members, we will see significant improvements in the satisfaction rates in future surveys.

[135] **Jocelyn Davies:** Do you know how many Members have responded this year?

[136] **Peter Black:** I do not know.

[137] **Mr Tosh:** I am afraid that I do not know.

[138] **Peter Black:** I would encourage every Member to respond.

[139] **Jocelyn Davies:** Yes. Mike is next.

[140] **Mike Hedges:** May I just add that I think that it is very important for every Member to respond, and perhaps we all should be trying to pressurise our colleagues who have not filled the survey in yet to do so?

[141] **Peter Black:** Yes, and your staff as well.

[142] **Mike Hedges:** My question is: now that you have more control over ICT delivery, what are your priority areas? What are we going to see being done first?

[143] **Peter Black:** The first thing that we need to do is to make the infrastructure fit for our purposes and needs, which means reinforcing it, as Dave outlined earlier on, in terms of simplifying the infrastructure and making it work towards what we want to see in terms of how that should be delivered. Our first priority has always been the Members' needs, so we are looking to expand and build on what we have already done in terms of the provision of mobile networking for Members through the provision of wireless, and we are looking, in terms of investment coming out of that insourcing, at investment in the telephone service and moving towards the '.cymru' and '.wales' domain names by the end of the year.

[144] We are also looking at the constituency offices, how we can improve connectivity in the constituency offices, how we can free up the Wi-Fi and local internet connection in the constituency offices, and at the kit that is available in the local constituency offices as well. A major project that is coming up in the short to medium term is the refresh of the Chamber. That equipment is quite old now and we are looking to refresh that. We have carried out a survey of Members as to the most appropriate way to do that. We are now putting together solutions as to how we can deliver on what Members told us they want to see in the Chamber for the future.

[145] **Mike Hedges:** May I throw you two general problems? You do not appear—tell me if I have got this wrong—to have produced a list of how long you should wait for different problems to be resolved. For example, a screen went down in my office and we waited two days for it to be replaced. Is there a standard for how long you should wait for these things to happen? If that does exist, I am sure that most, if not all, Members would like to see it.

[146] Secondly, I have a problem I was told to ask you about by Rhodri Glyn. [*Laughter.*] Nicola can confirm that. One of the problems, if you are typing in Welsh, is that everything comes out underlined. Is there any means, or are you looking to have a means, by which you can have a Welsh dictionary attached to it so that it checks it, and you can toggle between English and Welsh? We would all like to toggle rather than have to load anything up.

[147] **Jocelyn Davies:** Mike wants to reduce the amount of red in his Word documents.

[148] **Peter Black:** I can try to answer the second question. I am going to refer the first question to Dave because he has the detail in terms of what is expected in terms of the performance of support staff and service personnel. I understand that you can download a Welsh language dictionary, which should reduce the amount of red on your document. You should be able to run that side by side with the English language dictionary. If you need any technical help with that, we can provide that.

[149] **Mike Hedges:** Which Welsh language dictionary do you download?

[150] **Mr Tosh:** We have a Welsh language dictionary available already. As Peter said, we can work with you to sort that one out.

[151] **Mike Hedges:** It is not just me that does not know that that exists. The Commissioner responsible for the Welsh language also does not know that it exists. He has the same problem, in effect; it goes into red when he types in Welsh. Perhaps you could make it more generally available to all Members and not just—. I am not sure how many people have that dictionary downloaded at the moment.

[152] **Jocelyn Davies:** In fairness to the Commissioner responsible for the Welsh language,

he is probably very confident in Welsh and does not use any sort of—. He just disables the spellcheck, which was his advice to you.

[153] **Peter Black:** It is available on all Assembly machines. Dave can answer the first question.

[154] **Jocelyn Davies:** Yes, I think maybe that is something that we ought to take up.

[155] **Mr Tosh:** In answer to your first question, Mike, there are standards in place to deal with all categories of issues, from major issues down to issues that affect an individual Member. They are published on the intranet, but I am more than happy to make those more widely known if that is of interest. The other way, of course, is to do it through your account manager. If you have an account manager, you have issues and you are feeling that the service is not what it should be, they should always be your first point of contact to progress it. However, there are standards there and published, which are not, actually, any different from the standards we had from Atos.

[156] **Mike Hedges:** In my view, the intranet is awfully cluttered. There is so much information on there that I have a tendency to miss large chunks of it. I will move on to another question: you have lots of different users at different levels in terms of what they need and also with different levels of skill and ability. How do you gauge or prioritise the different user needs?

[157] **Peter Black:** We do have people who walk the corridors and do coaching sessions for Members and Assembly Members' support staff. Coaching and training can be arranged fairly quickly. If you have a particular training or support need, it can be put in place by requesting it through ICT or through your account manager.

[158] **Mr Tosh:** If I may add to that for your information, since we have taken the service over, we have created a dedicated post to support the case worker system. That has never been in place before. I know that there are varying views about the case worker system, but the dedicated support is a significant improvement and we are seeing improvement there. We are in the process of identifying a dedicated trainer as well, and the role of the account manager is key to all of this in understanding your individual needs. Where you have needs and you are unsure about using equipment or whatever, that always has to be your first point of call. They will arrange to deal with that and provide the necessary support you need.

10:00

[159] **Jocelyn Davies:** Ffred is next.

[160] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Diolch yn fawr. Mae adroddiad perfformiad y Comisiwn yn dangos cynnydd o 8% yn nifer y staff o fis Mehefin 2013 i fis Ebrill 2014. Faint o'r cynnydd hwnnw sy'n gysylltiedig â throsglwyddo i ddarparu gwasanaethau technoleg gwybodaeth yn fewnol?

**Alun Ffred Jones:** Thank you very much. The Commission's performance report shows an increase of 8% in staff numbers from June 2013 to April 2014. How much of this increase is linked to the insourcing of ICT services?

[161] **Peter Black:** I would say that it is virtually all linked to the insourcing of IT services. When we took on board that role, we had to appoint the requisite number of staff to deal with a whole range of issues that had previously been contracted out to Atos. However, we have effectively not just covered the cost of those additional staff, but actually made savings by reducing the amount of money that we pay to Atos. To give you an example, in 2013-14, we were spending £590,000 on staff; in 2014-15, it is £1.509 million. In terms of contracted

services, in 2013-14, we were spending £2.267 million, and in 2014-15, it is £542,000. Together, that amounts to an £805,000 saving in the total amount of money being spent on ICT. So, we spent the money on staff, but we are spending much less in terms of the contract to Atos. We now have staff in place, employed by us, who we directly control and who can do the work that Atos was doing before, but also, because we have that skill in-house, they are able to carry out developments and other work, which, in the past, we had to pay extra to Atos to do. So, there are additional savings as part of that as well.

[162] **Alun Ffred Jones:** A ydy hynny'n **Alun Ffred Jones:** Does that suggest that the awgrymu bod y cytundeb gydag Atos wedi contract with Atos has been very poor in bod yn un gwael iawn o safbwynt gwerth am terms of value for money for the Assembly? arian i'r Cynulliad?

[163] **Peter Black:** We did not think that it was providing value for money. It was not our contract, of course; it was a Welsh Government contract, and the Welsh Government continues to have that contract with Atos. We took the opt-out at the time when it was available to us, whereas the Welsh Government decided to extend that contract. We found that it was very poor value for money; there were additional costs in there that we felt were unjustified. For example, the total cost of the phase 2 upgrade to the Chamber was £660,000. Of that, £180,000 was resource costs that we paid to Atos. There were always those huge costs on top. Sometimes, it was 10% or 20% of a contract, or maybe more, which we will no longer have to bear because we now have complete control over that.

[164] **Jocelyn Davies:** Are there any other questions from Members? There are not. Thank you very much for your attendance here today. We will send you a transcript to check before we publish it, but, again, I think that was a very useful session.

10:03

**Cynnig o dan Reol Sefydlog 17.42 i Benderfynu Gwahardd y Cyhoedd o'r  
Cyfarfod**

**Motion under Standing Order 17.42 to Resolve to Exclude the Public from the  
Meeting**

**Jocelyn Davies:** I move that

*the committee resolves to exclude the public from the remainder of the meeting in accordance with Standing Order No. 17.42(vi).*

[165] Does everybody agree? I see that you do.

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion agreed.*

*Daeth rhan gyhoeddus y cyfarfod i ben am 10:03.  
The public part of the meeting ended at 10:03.*